

Present: Drs. Arnaout, Blacker, Born, Burstein, Connelly, Daley, Da Silva, Donoff, Farrell, Haigis, Keating, Klig, Nagler, Padwa, Pauker, Podolsky, Pomahac, Poussaint, Rexrode, Slanetz, Stone, Struhl, Tarbell, Tuomala

Guest: Mss. Brodrick, Delgado, Dolisca, McDowell, Muto, Rice; Drs. Burnett-Bowie, Golan, Reede, Saldaña, Westlund

Staff: Mss. Dale and Hecht; Dr. Lensch

Dean Daley called the meeting to order by welcoming everyone and calling for approval of the Faculty Council (FC) minutes from the January 11, 2017 meeting; so moved, seconded, no objections, the minutes were approved.

Dean Daley asked Dr. Farrell to review the FC Vice Chair election process; Dr. Farrell summarized those duties to include setting the FC agenda in consultation with the docket committee. Information regarding member eligibility for Vice Chair service was also provided. Pending successful nominations, the new Vice Chair will be announced at the March meeting.

Dean Daley then invited Ms. Melissa Brodrick, the HMS Ombudsperson, to offer a report on her office's activities. Ms. Brodrick articulated great love for her job and the work of the office. Ms. Brodrick shared some basic statistics and then invited questions from the group.

The office of the Ombudsperson has an open door policy and is highly confidential; anyone can come forward with any sort of issue. Ms. Brodrick assists people to better understand issues, their own interests, and goals helping to think through the options available to them. She provided a few anonymized examples of visits and issues in order to provide a view into her office's activities (including that in the week of the FC meeting, she had received 63 complaints about snow). The largest area of inquiry relates to issues in the work/academic environment though the office does a great deal of specific training for trainees and faculty. Dean Daley asked if medical students are prone to utilize the office and Ms. Brodrick responded that students tend to go to the Societies for help.

Overall, the office's activities for AY15-16 tracked in a manner that was consistent with AY14-15.

Ms. Broderick posed an issue to the FC: It is her sense that considering the entirety of the time spent in her role at HMS, in the past 9 months the issue of political upheaval and unease has increased. What can faculty do to reinforce civility in the HMS community? How do we make the community values statement more than a document? What is appropriate to do proactively versus reactively?

Dean Daley reinforced the value of maintaining civility and professionalism across our entire community. While there may be institutional rivalry and sniping, commentary made in a spirit of competition and what is corrosive are entirely different from one another. An action plan is needed to address the importance of civility in the school and workplace.

Discussion arose based upon the statistics provided including the observation that there were significantly more visits to the office from women than men. The question was raised as to whether or not HMS is doing enough to support its women faculty. Ms. Brodrick noted that the office started via the efforts of the Joint Committee on the Status of Women (JCSW). She does not know if women are more likely to make use of her services compared to men and noted that there are some systemic issues that impact women. In general, she listens for recurring themes and then develops proactive trainings around them.

Dean Daley stated that the pressures and tensions in academic research now are worse than 20 years ago.

A complicated question was then posed: Are the people seeking training the ones who most need it and if not, how to narrow this gap? The FC was very troubled by the notion of abusive or insulting behavior in our community, recognizing that it is challenging to know how to address this. Ms. Brodrick responded that those paying attention to training are not necessarily those who most need it. As one approach, it was noted that the BWH requires training of all physicians; zero tolerance is needed. Ms. Brodrick stated that leadership is in a position to hold people accountable and to have a “zero tolerance policy” and that one question for leadership is how far something should be allowed to go before it is no longer acceptable. A formal grievance policy is part of the HMS values statement.

When asked if additional staffing would be of benefit to her office, Ms. Brodrick responded in the affirmative, and that the office could accomplish much more with an additional FTE.

Dean Daley asserted that HMS should include/reaffirm its statement of values in the context of reviews, admissions, recruitments, and other forms of formal and informal processes. As there have been challenges, such as the immigration ban, difficult times have also caused people to speak more about community and our values. Effective activism must be the case.

Dean Daley then invited Dr. Joan Reede, Dean for Diversity and Community Partnership, to move the group into the next item on the agenda.

Dean Daley announced the formation of the HMS Inclusion and Diversity Task Force for which he asked Dean Reede to serve as chair. The Task Force will collaborate with the University’s overall efforts in this domain. HMS has assembled a group of faculty, students and staff that truly represents our community.

Dean Daley charged the task force to focus on four areas across our HMS community:

1. An HMS diversity and inclusion vision and policy, which are consistent with our mission and values.
2. Measures of accountability to evaluate the achievement of diversity and inclusion goals and expectations.
3. Understanding the landscape of the boarder HMS community and University diversity and inclusion resources and offerings.
4. Prioritization and exploration of areas of diversity and inclusion for further investigation, goal-setting and action.

Dean Daley informed the FC that Harvard has announced its own Task Force on Diversity and Belonging. HMS has unique facets that require our own particular engagement on this issue. Dean Reede will do a more HMS-centric analysis. To comment on the charge, Dean Daley went on to state that he wished for this effort to include developing a vision and policy that builds upon our values statement, to include measures, set goals, and determine our progress. It is a challenging task. Our broader community is enormous. What Dean Daley hopes to get back is a sense of prioritization of goals in the area of diversity and inclusion so that we can make progress. Important issues are at the forefront in current public discourse. This is an opportunity.

Dean Reede provided an opening statement about President Faust's task force which will be an 18-24 month project across four areas: demographics, the fabric of our institutions and lived experience, academic resources and contributions, and structures (offices and program and how they work – or fail to work – together). Dean Reede stated that HMS is looking for a statement in these areas that takes into account our institution.

Dean Reede introduced four HMS student (M.D. program) who provided comments and handouts. Each speaker also represents a specific student group though with intersecting issues. Other guests who did not participate on the panel included: Dr. Fidencio Saldana (Dean for Students) and Dr. Sherri-Ann Burnett-Bowie (Faculty Assistant Dean for Student Affairs in the Office of Recruitment and Multicultural Affairs).

Jayne Rice (HMS'20) representing the Student National Medical Association (SNMA). HMS has exceeded her expectations. She found on a smaller scale the black community she was looking for which has been critical to her wellness. There are events that allow URM students to meet URM faculty. Sessions on microaggression, bias, and race are important. However, there is a lack of diversity in the student population with the need to increase interview and acceptance rates. There are currently only ten black medical students and one black dental student. There are no black students in MD-PhD or HST. The experiences

of black students are reflect these numbers; if HMS had more black students, responsibilities would be better dispersed. Other areas of improvement include that interview day could be run better. Her group takes the time to meet with students 1 on 1 during interview day though those efforts may fall short if better financial aid packages are not offered. The FC should study this issue and come up with creative ways to offer better financial aid packages.

Daniels Delgado (HMS'17) who also represents the Latino Student Medical Association (LSMA) at HMS. Good things include the office of recruitment and international affairs which is effective as a dedicated group. HMS also has inspiring teaching faculty leadership and support for students with different immigration status. Challenges include those institutional – there is some support but not enough for students, there are few minority faculty, a lack of representation among different cultures for how things are named and which do not reflect all populations, the presence of micro-aggressions; all of which makes Latino student wonder if they truly belong here or not. What would make the student experience better includes strengthening the Office of Recruitment and Multicultural Affairs (ORMA) as a home for all students including diversity of orientation and ethnicity, the hiring of a part-time or full-time position for undocumented students as is done at Harvard College, to be more practical about celebrating our diversity including in physical spaces where we might showcase cultural pieces of art, bringing about curriculum changes to actively teach about unconscious bias, to require at least one session on unconscious bias and discrimination, and the need for more admissions offers and acceptances from URM students.

Michal McDowell (HMS'18) also representing Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, and Allies at Harvard Medical School/Harvard School of Dental Medicine (LAHMS). Ms. McDowell began with a definition of vocabulary. Jessica Halem was hired to support the LGBT community as Program Director and is great. Areas for improvement include the need for more support overall. Additionally, though the curriculum has improved, there is no overall content for LGBTQ topics which leads to a deficit in the ability to treat LGBTQ patients. Also, admissions do not reflect population statistics as the numbers of “out” students are not close to what would be expected in the general population. For recruitment and acceptance, we don’t collect information from LGBTQ data and what information is available is not shared with Jessica Halem. It would be helpful to designate a faculty member to ensure curricular LGBTQ inclusion as well as to designate an admissions faculty or staff person to make sure that more queer students are represented including during interviews. Having LGBTQ presence in ORMA, including having Jessica Halem there a few times a week, would be helpful.

Sarah Dolisca (HMS'17) also representing the Students National Medical Association (SNMA) and the Women of Color in Medicine and Dentistry at HMS. Her group distributed a survey to gather greater viewpoints. Where HMS is doing well includes the high level of support in the clinical environment through ORMA. There is additionally a very strong intra- and interclass community. The community works together to make sure everyone is successful. Areas of challenge include: admissions – low URM recruitment and the loss of students to other institutions because of a lack of merit-based awards as some institutions provide full scholarships plus a stipend; in clinical years there is a notable difference between the level of support in TMEC compared to what students encounter in the hospitals – the transition between medical school to clinical work is even harder than the transition encountered between undergraduate studies and the start of medical school; there are a fair amount of networking opportunities among URM students and faculty but a better job could be done if such encounters were formalized; alumni – peer institutions like the Harvard Business School and the Kennedy School of Government provide much better access to their alumni than does HMS. Suggested interventions included: reconsidering the financial aid policy, improved efforts at recruitment, support in clinical years, organizing informational networking events so that students are able to meet URM faculty, and to bring HMS alumni back to campus so that students can meet them.

At this point, Dean Reede opened things up to questions. One comment was that we have many URM faculty at Harvard and need to do better to connect students to them, though the available budget for such events was recognized as being small. It was further pointed out that there are many students who are not “out”, especially among the URM population. The response to the latter point was to inquire as to where the LGBTQ “check box” information on the HMS secondary application was being directed? While it is understood that there are many people who are not “out”, nevertheless, the situation is such that more people should feel comfortable declaring their status if they wish. Dean Daley suggested that we find a better way to gather relevant data and get it to where it might be most helpful.

Dean Daley mentioned a recent discussion of the Council of Deans. Harvard is the last bastion of fully need-based financial aid policy. There may now be some receptivity at Harvard to re-evaluate this policy. There is a rising tide of the issue of socio-economic status as part of diversity. Harvard’s undergraduate financial aid policy is the most generous among our peer institutions; news that does not seem to make it into the public conversation. For the first time, this is an issue that will get proper discussion as there will be a university-wide initiative.

Dean Reede noted that there are cultural and environmental aspects at play here at admissions and also once students are part of the community. These include issues of perception. For example, if a person is an African-American woman applying to HMS or

visiting here and if they see no other African-American women, they are going to think twice about accepting an offer of admission.

A student guest observed that the physical space itself does not tell URM students that they are welcome; walking into the TMEC building, one sees busts of white men exclusively. There is a need for more cultural features in student spaces as the current décor makes one feel that they are not part of the main stream but rather “other”.

Dean Reede asked the FC members what their thoughts are to address issues in the clinical space and years. Two responses were that all faculty should be required to take bias training and that we should consider adding greater diversity among the paintings of “old white men.” It was recognized that there are logistical and resource challenges. Including a diversity imperative would help move the dial across other institutions.

An FC member who is also a residency program director noted that one clear issue is the high level of attrition from residency onward to faculty. On the ground level, a message to support advancement of URM individuals into the faculty ranks must come from the highest levels of the administration.

A poignant statement made was that “You can’t be what you can’t see.” HMS needs to work to gather people together so that individuals do not have to search for people with whom they identify.

A geographically specific question was posed: Do people leave the HMS community because it is in Boston? A response was made that we must increase the pipeline of students and fellows. Boston was noted to be a limitation, though it has improved. One student noted that her experience during her clinical years made her want to move away from Boston as she did not feel sufficient support here for diversity. However, the student felt that improving things at HMS population would have a greater impact, and would be more achievable, that would be the case of making Boston better.

Dean Daley thanked Dean Reede and the students for participating; concluding that it is clear that these are essential issues and are among the most important in his first year. He urged everyone present to think creatively about this.

Dean Daley adjourned the meeting at approximately 5:35 p.m.